



# Ethnic Studies Lesson 3Ha: Latino American Bilingual Education Debate, Part 1

**TOPIC:**

LATINO AMERICAN HISTORY

**GRADE LEVELS:**

11-12

**TIME:**

1½ HOURS

## California Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Themes, Values, and Principles Alignment

*Themes:*

4. Social Movements and Equity

*Values and Principles:*

6. Connect ourselves to past and contemporary social movements that struggle for social justice and an equitable and democratic society, and conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for a post-racist, post-systemic-racism society that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing.

## California English and Social Science Standards Alignment

*English Language Arts Standards (11th and 12th Grade):***Reading—Informational Text (RI.11-12)**

Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain. (RI.11-12.1)

Evaluate authors' differing points of view on the same historical event or issue by assessing the authors' claims, reasoning, and evidence. (RI.11-12.6)

## Lesson Purpose

Students will research the pros and cons of bilingual education for Latino/Hispanic Americans, take a position, and debate the merits of bilingual education in addressing race-based opportunities.

## Essential Questions

---

*What are some of the pros and cons of bilingual education in the US?*

*How successful has it been in addressing race-based educational opportunities?*

*How has life changed for Latino/Hispanic Americans over the last 250 years?*

## Materials

---

[DEBATE RUBRIC](#)

[PBS: The Battle for Bilingual Education](#)

[98th Percentile: Multilingualism Benefits & Challenges.](#)

[KWL Chart for Unit 3](#)

## Vocabulary

---

bilingual

## Lesson Steps

---

### Step 1:

- As a class, let students know that today we will prepare for a debate. We will spend one day preparing and one day debating. Remind students of the [DEBATE RUBRIC](#). Take time to review each norm, and let students know they will be evaluating themselves and the other team when the debate is concluded.

### Step 2:

- Ask students what they know about the history of bilingual education. Have students watch [PBS: The Battle for Bilingual Education](#) (video 4 minutes, 41 seconds). As students watch, they should take notes on what were the pushes for parents to request bilingual education in Boston. What languages were being requested and why?
- Before students share their notes, as a class, use a group reading strategy such as round robin or popcorn to read [98th Percentile: Multilingualism Benefits & Challenges](#). As students read, they should take notes on what some of the disadvantages of learning a second language while trying to learn a first can be.
- When students have completed their notes, have them pair with another student to share their notes.

### Step 3:

- Once students have completed their notes, give every student a 3 x 5 card. Write the question “Does bilingual education improve educational opportunities for Latino/Hispanic students?”

1 - Yes, it is very beneficial today.	2 - Yes, it is still somewhat beneficial today.	3 - No, it is not as beneficial today.	4 - No, it is not beneficial at all today.
---------------------------------------	---	--	--

- On their 3 x 5 card, students should **NOT** put their name. They should put the question on the table, with their answer circled. Collect the cards from students and shuffle them. Students will be conducting an anonymized debate—meaning they may have to debate from someone else’s point of view (see more about this teaching strategy in additional resources at the end of this lesson).

- Give students a card and have them line up from 1-4. This process gives students an opportunity to see what range of opinions exist in the room. Students that have a 1-2 card will form one debate team that is FOR the question, and students with cards for 3-4 will form one group that is AGAINST the question. Some adjustments may need to be made in the group numbers in order to form equal teams.

**Step 4:**

- As a class, let students know that they will be presenting their arguments only from authoritative sources that must be cited. They will not use their own ideas or opinions. Researching bilingual education and all its nuances could take a lifetime. In order to find salient facts for a 20-minute debate, introduce the class to [ChatGPT](#).
- As a class, let students know that they may have used ChatGPT in order to find a quick question to a problem or to write an essay unethically. In this class, there will be essay assignments, but the essays and paragraphs will come from what was discussed and cited in class—making it impossible to pull the “correct” answers from ChatGPT. On the other hand, ChatGPT can be helpful in quickly filling in holes in understanding and can lead to appropriate websites in order to find citations.
- Add the following prompts to ChatGPT and share the results with students:

*As an expert in bilingual education, create a table of pros and cons for bilingual education in K-12. Embed website citations in the text and use a list of works cited at the end.*

*As an expert in bilingual education and using educational websites, write an article on the history of bilingual education in the US. Include the role of state laws in its implementation and how it is used in 2024. Embed website citations in the text and add a list of works cited at the end.*

*As an expert in bilingual education and using educational websites, write an article about the languages that have been taught bilingually in the US. Include languages from the United States’ early beginnings. Embed website citations in the text and add a list of works cited at the end.*

- Make sure that students see that the web links often do not work in the current version of ChatGPT. Even though AI is excellent for giving them ideas, it rarely leads to the exact source, and it makes mistakes. It is not appropriate for copying verbatim, and it cannot be cited. They will need to find the source in order to create a citation for their argument. Citations should come from reputable sources.
- Give student groups 3 x 5 cards for them to write down their evidence with citations. Give students time to form a strategy and to divide the work among their members. Students will finish researching and form the debate in the next lesson.

**Step 5:**

- Ask students to reflect on “What are some of the pros and cons of bilingual education in the US? How successful has it been in addressing race-based educational opportunities?” and “How has life changed for Latino/Hispanic Americans over the last 250 years?” Add what has been learned to this unit’s KWL chart.

## Essential Question Assessment, Application, Action, and Reflection

---

For homework, students can continue to conduct research and find evidence for their debate in the next class session.

## Additional Readings and Resources

---

Amselle, Jorge, ed. *The Failure of Bilingual Education*. Washington, D.C.: Center for Equal Opportunity, 1997.

[BBC: The AMAZING benefits of being bilingual](#)

Boghossian, Peter, and James Lindsay. *How to Have Impossible Conversation: A Very Practical Guide*. Lifelong Books, 2019.

Capaldi, Nicholas, and Miles Smit. *The Art of Deception: An Introduction to Critical Thinking*, 2nd ed. Prometheus, 2019.

[Education Week: Bilingual Education Traces Its US Roots to the Colonial Era](#)

Guerra, Manuel H. "Bilingualism and Biculturalism: Assets for Chicanos." In *The Chicanos: As We See Ourselves*, edited by Arnulfo D. Trejo, 121-32. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1980. [pro-bilingual ed]

[National Association for Independent Schools: Facilitating Politically Sensitive Discussions](#)

Porter, Rosalie Pedalino. "The Case Against Bilingual Education." *The Atlantic*, May 1998. <https://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/1998/05/the-case-against-bilingual-education/305426/>

Porter, Rosalie Pedalino. *Forked Tongue: The Politics of Bilingual Education*. Basic Books, 1990.

[Reason: Loco, Completamente Loco](#)

Sowell, Thomas. *Ethnic America: A History*. Basic Books, 1981, 244-270.

[Spanish Academy: The Pros and Cons of Bilingual Education](#)

[University of Michigan: Legislation Related to Bilingual Education](#)

**NOTE TO EDUCATORS REGARDING ADDITIONAL READINGS AND RESOURCES:** America is a pluralistic country, ethnically. It is also a pluralistic country politically—left, right, and center. Ethnic studies educators have ready access to resources from the left-of-center in the [2021 California Model Curriculum](#) and in the [Liberated Model Curriculum](#). This Comparative Cultures Ethnic Studies curriculum favors teachers exposing students to views from across the political spectrum. Educators often lack guidance to materials from outside the left-of-center. Therefore, in the sections on Additional Readings and Resources, the Comparative Cultures Ethnic Studies curriculum alerts educators to credible resources that provide an alternative to the other Model Curricula. In doing so, this curriculum encourages educators to acquaint students with evidence-based views from left, right, and center.

## Ethnic Studies 1Ia: Debate Rubric

---

Rate on a scale of 1 to 3, with 1 being did well in adhering to the norm and 3 being did not do well in adhering to norm.

**FOR TEAM**  
(1 to 3) and comments

**AGAINST TEAM**  
(1 to 3) and comments

Adhered to classroom norms of respect and allowing others to speak		
Included evidence with citation or attribution while inside the circle		
Provided supporting evidence with citation or attribution while outside the circle		
Participated in a lively debate even if the topic was not their first choice		
Encouraged different viewpoints, reflected on own biases and assumptions, challenged others to maintain an open mind		
Listened actively while not speaking		
Acknowledged differing points of view and maintained civility		

### Ethnic Studies 3A: KWL Chart

---

**KNOW**

**WONDER**

**LEARNED**

*What do we think we already know about this topic?*

*What do we wonder about this topic? Write your questions below.*

*After the research is completed, what did we learn? Make sure to cite your source.*

<i>What do we think we already know about this topic?</i>	<i>What do we wonder about this topic? Write your questions below.</i>	<i>After the research is completed, what did we learn? Make sure to cite your source.</i>