



# Ethnic Studies Lesson 3Hb: Latino American Bilingual Education Debate, Part 2

**TOPIC:**

LATINO AMERICAN HISTORY

**GRADE LEVELS:**

11-12

**TIME:**

1½ HOURS

## California Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Themes, Values, and Principles Alignment

*Themes:*

4. Social Movements and Equity

*Values and Principles:*

6. Connect ourselves to past and contemporary social movements that struggle for social justice and an equitable and democratic society, and conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for a post-racist, post-systemic-racism society that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing.

## California English and Social Science Standards Alignment

*English Language Arts Standards (11th and 12th Grade):***Reading—Informational Text (RI.11-12)**

Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain. (RI.11-12.1)

Evaluate authors' differing points of view on the same historical event or issue by assessing the authors' claims, reasoning, and evidence. (RI.11-12.6)

## Lesson Purpose

Students will research the pros and cons of bilingual education for Latino/Hispanic Americans, take a position, and debate the merits of bilingual education in addressing race-based opportunities.

## Essential Questions

---

*What are some of the pros and cons of bilingual education in the US?*

*How successful has it been in addressing race-based educational opportunities?*

*How has life changed for Latino/Hispanic Americans over the last 250 years?*

## Materials

---

[DEBATE RUBRIC](#)

[KWL Chart for Unit 3](#)

## Vocabulary

---

bilingual

## Lesson Steps

---

### *Step 1:*

- As a class, remind students about the [DEBATE RUBRIC](#). Take time to review each norm, and let students know they will be evaluating themselves and the other team when the debate is concluded.

### *Step 2:*

- As a class, have the two student groups continue their research and organize their cards by topic. Have them continue to pose questions to ChatGPT and continue finding evidence from reputable sources. Encourage students to anticipate the questions from the other group and research those questions in order to find rebuttals. Allow the groups to work for an additional 20 minutes if possible.

### *Step 3:*

- When the research time has elapsed, as a class, introduce the students to a circular debate. Half of the students from each team will sit in chairs that are arranged in a circle. The other half of the students will stand behind the students who are actively participating in the debate. The students who are standing are given sticky notes in order to remind the debate participants about key facts they may have forgotten. Students inside the circle will be holding the note cards the group has made with evidence.
- The students who are seated can start the discussion at any time by saying something like:
  - According to the website..., this point was made.
  - According to this authority..., this point was made.
- Students should listen carefully and wait their turn to speak. Seated students can also support their own team, but say something like:
  - I agree with my friend..., and I would add....
- Or students can disagree with the other team by saying something like:
  - While I see your point, I would disagree. According to this website..., this point was made....
- Students who are standing can pass sticky notes to those who are sitting in order to keep the debate going.

**Step 4:**

- As a class, once the debate is concluded, or after about 20 minutes, have the students return to their groups and have them make a copy of and fill out the [DEBATE RUBRIC](#) for their group.
- When students have completed the rubric, as a class, review the debate rubrics and have students discuss how their debate went. What can they do next time to improve? Did the debate change their attitudes about bilingual education?

**Step 5:**

- Ask students to reflect on “What are some of the pros and cons of bilingual education in the US? How successful has it been in addressing race-based educational opportunities?” and “How has life changed for Latino/Hispanic Americans over the last 250 years?” Add what has been learned to this unit’s KWL chart.

## Essential Question Assessment, Application, Action, and Reflection

---

For homework, have students write a short paragraph on how their beliefs about bilingual education stayed the same or changed over the course of the debate. Also, they should include in their paragraph their observations on some of the difficulties of trying to improve race-based societal opportunities.

## Additional Readings and Resources

---

Amselle, Jorge, ed. *The Failure of Bilingual Education*. Washington, D.C.: Center for Equal Opportunity, 1997.

[BBC: The AMAZING benefits of being bilingual](#)

Boghossian, Peter, and James Lindsay. *How to Have Impossible Conversation: A Very Practical Guide*. Lifelong Books, 2019.

Capaldi, Nicholas, and Miles Smit. *The Art of Deception: An Introduction to Critical Thinking*, 2nd ed. Prometheus, 2019.

[Education Week: Bilingual Education Traces Its US Roots to the Colonial Era](#)

Guerra, Manuel H. “Bilingualism and Biculturalism: Assets for Chicanos.” In *The Chicanos: As We See Ourselves*, edited by Arnulfo D. Trejo, 121-32. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1980. [pro-bilingual ed]

[National Association for Independent Schools: Facilitating Politically Sensitive Discussions](#)

Porter, Rosalie Pedalino. “The Case Against Bilingual Education.” *The Atlantic*, May 1998. <https://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/1998/05/the-case-against-bilingual-education/305426/>

Porter, Rosalie Pedalino. *Forked Tongue: The Politics of Bilingual Education*. Basic Books, 1990.

[Reason: Loco, Completamente Loco](#)

Sowell, Thomas. *Ethnic America: A History*. Basic Books, 1981, 244-270.

[Spanish Academy: The Pros and Cons of Bilingual Education](#)

[University of Michigan: Legislation Related to Bilingual Education](#)

**NOTE TO EDUCATORS REGARDING ADDITIONAL READINGS AND RESOURCES:** America is a pluralistic country, ethnically. It is also a pluralistic country politically—left, right, and center. Ethnic studies educators have ready access to resources from the left-of-center in the [2021 California Model Curriculum](#) and in the [Liberated Model Curriculum](#). This Comparative Cultures Ethnic Studies curriculum favors teachers exposing students to views from across the political spectrum. Educators often lack guidance to materials from outside the left-of-center. Therefore, in the sections on Additional Readings and Resources, the Comparative Cultures Ethnic Studies curriculum alerts educators to credible resources that provide an alternative to the other Model Curricula. In doing so, this curriculum encourages educators to acquaint students with evidence-based views from left, right, and center.

## Ethnic Studies 1Ia: Debate Rubric

---

Rate on a scale of 1 to 3, with 1 being did well in adhering to the norm and 3 being did not do well in adhering to norm.

**FOR TEAM**  
(1 to 3) and comments

**AGAINST TEAM**  
(1 to 3) and comments

Adhered to classroom norms of respect and allowing others to speak		
Included evidence with citation or attribution while inside the circle		
Provided supporting evidence with citation or attribution while outside the circle		
Participated in a lively debate even if the topic was not their first choice		
Encouraged different viewpoints, reflected on own biases and assumptions, challenged others to maintain an open mind		
Listened actively while not speaking		
Acknowledged differing points of view and maintained civility		

### Ethnic Studies 3A: KWL Chart

---

**KNOW**

**WONDER**

**LEARNED**

*What do we think we already know about this topic?*

*What do we wonder about this topic? Write your questions below.*

*After the research is completed, what did we learn? Make sure to cite your source.*

<i>What do we think we already know about this topic?</i>	<i>What do we wonder about this topic? Write your questions below.</i>	<i>After the research is completed, what did we learn? Make sure to cite your source.</i>